

Analysis, presentation and evaluation of PMBoG project Case Studies - I04/1

Index:

1. Introduction	1
2. Presentation of the 4 cases	2
3. Slides and case studies	3
4. Evaluation matrix elements	8
5. Summary evaluation matrix	10
6. Elements that led to the final decision	10

1 - Introduction

The purpose of this document is to present the 4 selected cases and give indications of the criteria that led us to the selection of a case, in our opinion most appropriate for the PMBoG project goals

The 4 case studies we selected were chosen in order to be extremely different from each other and to touch contexts not only related to the world of profit but also to the social, cultural, and with respect to everyday life.

For each case selected, the pros and cons were evaluated and a brief summary was drawn up to illustrate what are the learning/training and playful/game elements to be used.

The final choice was made on the basis of a matrix involving four main category of elements:

- 1) The elements of Project Management namely PMI elements
- 2) The "value" elements
- 3) The "Game" elements
- 4) The "Learning" aspects.

More than 40 variables were taken into account to decide which would be the most suitable case for our project, the metrics of each variable were defined in a scale between 1 and 10, 1 being the lowest value and 10 the highest.

A special thanks goes to the partners who supported us in this choice phase and gave us suggestions to arrive at the document you are reading and hence to lead to the final choice.

With respect to the selected cases, a brief summary of the context is in order.

2 - Presentation of the 4 cases

Wedding

Marriage, as a case study, turns out to be the most everyday event for many people, it is an event that surely has been experienced by many directly or indirectly.

A critical element could be linked to the fact that for some people it can be a bad memory, therefore within a board game the theme should have to be played down by using ironic elements.

The wedding lends itself very well to be played by both sexes, it is in fact an event that both men and women perceive as important, moreover the target audience is close to our objective, being the wedding today interested by people in their thirties.

A further element that led us to select this case together with the other three cases was the fact that it is an event that can be easily imagined, and that it is in any case close to our daily life. An element that can be considered a point of attention is to remind that it is a typically

christian function with respect to the way we presume it will be described, therefore aimed at a European rather than an international context.

Among the important characteristics of this case study it can be underlined the inclusion & management of possible “antagonist” characters. In fact it is easy to imagine in a wedding game, for example the presence of an ex-girlfriend or the father of the bride, or people who are, for some reason, against the wedding.

With respect to the elements of Project Management, marriage offers all the main principles; it has a well defined date and so a clear final deadline, a number of specific tasks/actions that must be carried out following certain criteria and obviously a limited budget with the expected result quality requested. With respect to the game, it is easy to imagine marriage with limited resources that must be conquered or gained by the players.

Relocation

Moving, like marriage, is an event that most probably has been experienced by our potential players, this case is also valid for both sexes and has therefore been taken into consideration as a case study.

Unlike the wedding, which has a very personal aspect and a very high stakeholder involvement, the location move is more aseptic and less involving than the religious function described above.

As with the wedding case there are many elements of project management, although these are more difficult to explain using this case study. A further element which led us to select this case regards the complex situations which can be encountered with the relocation operation; for example transporting important bulky parcel to a mountain hermitage, or moving some works of art by tight timeframe and so on.

The relocation has very different characteristics compared to marriage; while marriage is a binary operation, the target can be either reached i.e. the couple is married or not married, in the transport you can have a partial victory, 12 parcels out of 18 have been moved. This aspect if on one hand facilitates a score evaluation in a game on the other hand tends not to be clarifying of a clear and winning final objective of a board game.

The learning curve of moving, like that of marriage, is extremely light, it doesn't present any particular difficulty in explaining what a relocation means, and it doesn't have to have particularly challenging technical requirements for the player, this will allow players to approach the game in a very fast and immediate way, thus being able to shift their attention from the playful aspect to the training elements that we desire to transfer through the board game.

Abu Simbel Temple

The choice to include such an ambitious case study was made because this project, which took place in the 1960s, is one of the largest modern works of international cooperation.

The project, which is a real case study, presents the transport of an Egyptian temple over 33 metres high, to a safe position in relation to a dam which, within a determined time, would have submerged it.

Obviously this project has a lot of specific Project Management elements and is particularly stimulating from the engineering point of view, but typically this kind of activity involves more a male audience and is less interesting for a female audience who is attracted more by the beauty of the temple than by the process of cutting, transporting, reconstructing the whole temple.

This case, even if it surely presents a good score from the point of view of the PM elements, it is extremely complex with respect to the ludic/gaming aspects, which will have to be taken into consideration for the realisation of the board game.

A further critical element with respect to the Abu Simbel temple project is that of the technical skills required to approach this case study. In fact, the work carried out in the 1960s was actually a worldwide effort with extremely different skills ranging from the geological aspect to the engineering aspect, passing through the physical cutting of the rock carried out by some Italian structures in Carrara.

The main problem of this case study that has been found lies in being extremely sectoral and not well known to most of the potential players, this leads to a less emotional involvement of the project compared, for example, to what can be the marriage or relocation.

Sustainable Tourist Village

The last case study analysed is that of a sustainable tourist village that should be built during the game playing. The project is a particularly interesting and very current topic. Moreover, the tourist village is appreciated by players of all ages and both sexes, and is linked to a pleasant event such as holidays.

However, the project of building a village is technically demanding, especially if one wants to emphasize the sustainability aspects, for example, the use of various forms of alternative energies, such as tidal energy compared to wind energy, should be taken into account and compared with each other, and this is therefore an extremely technical aspect and difficult to disseminate to a wide audience.

Another aspect to be taken into consideration is that there can be conflicts between extremely important areas, such as the issue of people's wellbeing compared to that of the environmental aspects, typically the case of ILVA Taranto can be a clear example of how health and economic wellbeing come into conflict, this type of aspect within a game can be a deterrent rather than a stimulus to play a game using this case study.

The learning curve for the design and implementation of a tourist village is particularly steep. Being a very large and structured project, it could be presented in an extremely guided way in order to facilitate playability for players, but this situation would take away the freedom of players to make autonomous choices that would almost always be binding.

3 - Slides and case studies

Case Studies for IO4

AccessPoint Coop Soc Onlus

Wedding



*<https://www.lenius.it/matrimonio-in-italia/>

PROS

- Event known by almost everybody being in our full target audience (32 years women 35 men)
- Emotional involvement and associated with enjoyable event
- Valid for both sexes
- Simple to "imagine"
- Simple to include humorous elements
- Possibility of inserting "funny" antagonists

CONS

- Not suitable for all religions
- May be "uncomfortable" for the divorced people

Summary: It is the blueprint for life for many. It presents all the elements of a project and it is very easy to insert ironic and funny elements to make the game more pleasant and involving. It lends itself well to a competitive game with elements of mediation (monopoly style), the choice of limited resources (assets) to take and manage with respect to the type of spouses offers a different experience for each game. It is easy to understand "hierarchical" & "systemic" relationships between actions, e.g. if I don't know the church I can't plan how many guests to invite, or vice versa.

Relocation



PROS

- Event most experienced by players
- Valid for both sexes
- Event that lends itself well to "problems" of design
- Very simple to "imagine"

CONS

- Often experienced as a traumatic event
- Often handled by third parties and not personal

Summary: It is an event that almost all of us have been through, this allows for simplification of the explanation and introduction phase to the main concept. We can have many design ideas with respect to what to bring and the conditions and location (hermitage in the mountains or beach house). We can envision different types of people benefiting from the move (sportsman, musician, antique dealer, etc.). The case lends itself well to a partial win or score management rather than an all-or-nothing. The case is not very exciting and to have an involvement we need to work much more on the game mechanics and on the interaction between the players.

Temple of Abu Simbel



PROS

- Historical and culturally relevant fact
- "Rational" and engineering involvement
- Strong cultural involvement
- UNESCO heritage

CONS

- More engaging for a male audience
- Extremely sectorial and little known fact
- "Violated" by an Italian archaeologist
- High cultural level

Summary: This is the case that requires the most planning; being a real case, a careful player might question the mechanics presented by the game. The case lends itself very well to the concept of "race against time". The game and the mechanics will have to be close to those of a "strategic/management game" but with a cooperative spirit and not competitive, if not between work teams (e.g. trenching, cutting, positioning, maintenance, etc.). This is the most complex case to think and explain to a player with a very steep learning curve. Being a real case, the presence of irony or antagonists may be inappropriate.

Sustainable Tourist Village



PROS

- Theme of strong current impact
- Valid for both sexes
- Associated with pleasant event
- Educational for the sustainability aspect

CONS

- Event not "pressing" as a project deadline
- Many, perhaps too many topics to cover (environmental, social and economic)
- Very sensitive and personal topics (environmental & social)

Summary: Starting from the 2030 agenda and its 17 goals, the case aims to design and implement a sustainable island. The case is very timely and uses an environment associated with pleasant things. It is pointed out that the case could "oversimplify" complex processes that would leave the player unsatisfied. Also the modeling process is particularly complex and questionable in its presentation (better wind or solar or wave?). A current case but difficult to implement as a project if not extremely guided and with constrained choices.

Summary Evaluation Matrix

"PMI" Elements (17)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village	
Subtotal x	108	87	118	121	
"Value" Elements (10)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village	
Subtotal x	78	57	50	59	
"Game" Elements (12)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village	
Subtotal x	92	88	60	73	
"Learning" elements (5)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village	
Subtotal x	38	25	42	40	
Total	316	257	270	293	

Evaluation comments and case chosen



Elements that led us to the decision: In light of the evaluations made regarding both individually each case study and the overall category evaluation elements of the summary matrix, the case that was selected is that of the Wedding project. The reasons that led us to this final choice were mainly two; the first is that the wedding project has excellent elements to be transformed into a game with playful elements, ironic, allows you to include cooperative and competitive situations. At the same time, the wedding case offers excellent elements with respect to project management; it can be defined; tasks & milestones, identified stakeholders, manage possible risks, monitor activities and evaluate level of project success, all those items that are the typical elements of a project.

From the educational point of view all the cases were evaluated almost at the same level and they offer extremely valid ideas to include within them the educational components, the wedding in this context was in line with the other case studies, so both the elements of project management and the playful ones were positively evaluated.

4 - Evaluation matrix elements

As mentioned in the introduction, the work on the matrix has been structured based on 4 major element pillars. You will find the details of the matrix in an attached excel sheet. Hereby we try to introduce and explain the four areas that have been selected.

Project Management, “PMI” Elements

With regard to the basic "technical" elements of project management, the so-called knowledge areas and process groups of PMI were taken as reference. In fact, 17 elements were identified that belong to the 10 Knowledge Areas and 5 Process Groups described in the "PMBok Guide". As it can be seen, we have included all the main elements that are necessary to keep in mind, in any project you want to manage in order to allow you to Start, to Plan, to Execute, to Monitor and Control and finally to Close the project.

"Value" Elements

In addition to the "technical" elements of Project Management, 10 more elements have been identified that we have baptized with the elements of the "value" of the project rather than the pure "business" oriented elements. In our opinion these elements allow to highlight, on the one hand the global "value" of the final result of the project and on the other hand a series of characteristics aimed at the involvement of the PM "player", through the management of

situations of surprise and opportunity rather than ethics, empathy and emotional management. Obviously in this category the level of general (basic) knowledge of the case study has a fundamental weight.

“Game” Elements -

The main game elements that were taken into consideration are linked to the usability and involvement of the game product to be created. We therefore evaluated the humorous aspects that can link training to an entertainment context, we took into strong consideration the ease of modelling the project, trying to understand how easy it would be to realise the project and for the player to approach it. This aspect in particular defined what is the learning curve of the game. As a logic we used the saying "Easy to learn and difficult to Master".

Another element that guided our choices was the possibility of having a game that would be both cooperative and competitive, therefore having particularly in mind the competitive oriented purpose which today is present in almost all cases together with elements of shared choices and interaction between the players. The purpose of this choice is linked to the fact of having a strong interaction between the players, and not to develop a board game that would be exclusively against the system. A strong interaction between the players increases both the player entertainment and involvement. Obviously all the “game” elements in a way or other should be linked to the Project Management case study in order to best support training aspects.

“Learning” Elements -

In all the four cases presented there are the learning elements of Project Management, so in this context we tried to go in depth on some aspects that were considered more important, such as the management of the accumulations and delays, the value elements, and the long and short term objectives. In addition to these vertically oriented features, an attempt was made to make an assessment that could offer a formative edge for learners. In all the case studies we tried to consider time, budget, quality, risk management and also to take into account the principles of the planning together with the concept of systems approach.

In conclusion the real challenge with respect to the cases presented is to choose the best combination of the training elements with the playful elements using the edutainment methodology.

5 - Summary Evaluation Matrix

	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village
“PMI” Elements (17)				
Subtotal x	108	87	118	121
"Value" Elements (10)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village
Subtotal x	78	57	50	59
“Game” Elements (12)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village
Subtotal x	92	88	60	73
“Learning” Elements (5)	Wedding	Relocation	Abu Simbel	Tourism Village
Subtotal x	38	25	42	40
TOTAL	316	257	270	293

6 - Elements that led to the final decision:

In light of the evaluations made with respect to both the individual cases and the elements of the matrix the case that was selected is the **Wedding project**.

As it can be seen in the summary evaluation matrix, the considerations that led us to define marriage as the best case were based on more than 40 variables.

Beyond a mere numerical evaluation, the involvement that the wedding case offers (regarding indifferently men and women players) was primarily taken into consideration. In addition to this element, we looked for a case that could be easily “manageable” and preferably has been already treated in other contexts. In fact, just thinking of the world of cinema or that of novels, both have continuously drawn on this theme to create various articulated narratives, which in our case will become the narrative of the game.

Other two practical reasons led us to this choice. Firstly the wedding project has excellent elements to be transformed into a game with playful and ironic elements, it allows to include cooperative and competitive situations. At the same time, the marriage case offers excellent elements in terms of general project management; it is possible to define milestones, to identify stakeholders, to take into account risks and plan risk management and so on.

From the training point of view, almost all the case studies are on the same level and offer extremely valid ideas to include within them the teaching components, the wedding in this context is in line with the other cases. Both the project management and play elements were evaluated positively.

Another element that has led us to the choice of this case is linked to the ease of explanation of the case, while explaining the Abu Simbel project, or the design, construction and implementation of a sustainable tourist village are particularly complex and articulated, the wedding is an event in which, we believe, almost all the players will find themselves to be part or protagonists or guests. In addition we believe that for this case study there will be an extremely smooth learning curve. This is going to be supported also with the presence of “antagonist” characters that can be imagined to be different for each game played, so even if the game mechanics will be the same compared to the various games the dynamics that will be established in each game could be always different.

Again with respect to the evaluation matrix criteria, the elements of “value” are very relevant for the wedding, both because it is an event that touches the person directly, so it is easy to empathise with the bride and groom or with the wedding event itself. It is also extremely easy to include a whole series of elements that can be useful for the edutainment training model.

The wedding is by its nature an event that is often told and discussed; we talk about the wedding lunch, how the bride was dressed (especially for a female audience), and everything that orbits around this party; the idea of having so many active elements to be able to insert them inside the board game has pushed us not only to select the wedding as the best case, but also to start to make already some in-depth studies about what can be the types of spouses, the unexpected or the risk management related to some single task of the project and so on.

The sum of all these reasons, some purely technical, others linked to the playful aspect, led us not only to select the wedding as a case study but also to evaluate it as the most suitable choice.